

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

-----X  
Elchonon Schwartz

Plaintiff,

Index No: 1:20-cv-8605

-against-

Demand for Trial by Jury

Experian Information Solutions, Inc.,  
VW Credit, Inc. d/b/a Bentley Financial Services

Defendant(s).  
-----X

**COMPLAINT**

Plaintiff Elchonon Schwartz ("Plaintiff"), by and through his attorneys, and as for his Complaint against Defendant Experian Information Solutions, Inc. ("Experian") and Defendant VW Credit, Inc. d/b/a Bentley Financial Services ("VW Credit") respectfully sets forth, complains, and alleges, upon information and belief, the following:

**JURISDICTION AND VENUE**

1. The Court has jurisdiction over this matter pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1367, as well as 15 U.S.C. § 1681p *et seq.*
2. Venue is proper in this judicial district pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1391(b)(2), being that the acts and transactions occurred here, Plaintiff resides here, and the Defendants transact business here.
3. Plaintiff brings this action for damages arising from the Defendants' violations of 15 U.S.C. § 1681 *et seq.*, commonly known as the Fair Credit Reporting Act ("FCRA").

**PARTIES**

4. Plaintiff is a resident of the State of New York, County of New York, residing at 160 West 62<sup>nd</sup> St., Apt 40C, New York, NY 10023.
5. At all times material hereto, Plaintiff was a “consumer” as said term is defined under 15 U.S.C. § 1681a(c).
6. Defendant Experian Information Solutions, Inc., is a consumer reporting agency as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1681a(f) and conducts substantial and regular business activities in this judicial district. Defendant Experian is an Ohio corporation registered to do business in the State of New York, and may be served with process upon CT Corporation System, 28 Liberty St., New York, NY 10005.
7. At all times material here to Experian is a consumer reporting agency regularly engaged in the business of assembling, evaluating and disbursing information concerning consumers for the purpose of furnishing consumer reports, as said term is defined under 15 U.S.C. § 1681a(p) to third parties.
8. At all times material hereto, Experian disbursed such consumer reports to third parties under a contract for monetary compensation.
9. Defendant VW Credit, Inc. d/b/a Bentley Financial Services is a person who furnishes information to consumer reporting agencies under 15 U.S.C. § 1681s-2 with an address for service at Corporation Service Company, 80 State Street, Albany, New York 12207.

**FACTUAL ALLEGATIONS**

10. Plaintiff incorporates by reference all of the above paragraphs of this Complaint as though fully stated herein with the same force and effect as if the same were set forth at length herein.

**VW Credit Account Dispute and Violation**

11. On or about December of 2013, Plaintiff entered an automobile lease agreement with Defendant VW Credit.

12. All payments were made on time over the course of the lease.

13. On information and belief, on a date better known to Defendant Experian, Experian prepared and issued credit reports concerning the Plaintiff that included inaccurate and materially misleading information relating to his VW Credit account.

14. The information furnished by VW Credit and published by Experian falsely and inaccurately characterizes Plaintiff's account status.

15. On Plaintiff's Experian report, the VW Credit account status is "Paid in settlement/Never late", in spite of the fact this account was not paid "in settlement".

16. Furthermore, the report includes the following misleading and inherently contradictory comment: "Account paid in full for less than full balance."

17. Experian has been reporting this inaccurate information through the issuance of false and inaccurate credit information and consumer reports that it has disseminated to various persons and credit grantors, both known and unknown.

18. Plaintiff notified Experian that he disputed the accuracy of the information Experian was reporting on or around April 22, 2020, specifically stating in a letter sent to Experian that he was disputing the negative reporting of this trade line.

19. It is believed and therefore averred that Experian notified Defendant VW Credit of the Plaintiff's dispute.
20. Upon receipt of the dispute of the account from Experian, VW Credit failed to timely conduct a reasonable investigation and continued to report false and inaccurate adverse information on the consumer report of the Plaintiff with respect to the disputed account, continuing to include the negative comment.
21. Despite the dispute by the Plaintiff that the information on his consumer report was inaccurate with respect to the disputed account, Experian did not timely evaluate or consider any of the information, claims, or evidence of the Plaintiff and did not timely make an attempt to substantially reasonably verify that the derogatory information concerning the disputed account was inaccurate.
22. Experian violated 15 U.S. Code § 1681i (a)(1)(A) by failing to conduct a reasonable investigation and deleting the disputed trade line within 30 days of receiving Plaintiff's dispute letter.
23. Notwithstanding Plaintiff's efforts, Defendants continued to publish and disseminate such inaccurate information to other third parties, persons, entities and credit grantors.
24. As a result of Defendants' failure to comply with the FCRA, the Plaintiff suffered damage by loss of credit, loss of ability to purchase and benefit from credit, a chilling effect on applications for future credit, and the mental and emotional pain, anguish, humiliation and embarrassment of credit denial.

**FIRST CAUSE OF ACTION**

**(Willful Violation of the FCRA as to Experian)**

25. Plaintiff incorporates by reference all of the above paragraphs of this Complaint as though fully stated herein with the same force and effect as if the same were set forth at length herein.

26. This is an action for willful violation of the Fair Credit Reporting Act U.S.C. § 1681 *et seq.*

27. Experian violated 15 U.S.C. § 1681e by failing to establish or to follow reasonable procedures to assure maximum possible accuracy in the preparation of the credit report and credit files that Experian maintained concerning the Plaintiff.

28. Experian has willfully and recklessly failed to comply with the Act. The failure of Experian to comply with the Act include but are not necessarily limited to the following:

- a) The failure to follow reasonable procedures to assure the maximum possible accuracy of the information reported;
- b) The failure to correct erroneous personal information regarding the Plaintiff after a reasonable request by the Plaintiff;
- c) The failure to remove and/or correct the inaccuracy and derogatory credit information after a reasonable request by the Plaintiff;
- d) The failure to promptly and adequately investigate information which Defendant Experian had notice was inaccurate;
- e) The continual placement of inaccurate information into the credit report of the Plaintiff after being advised by the Plaintiff that the information was inaccurate;
- f) The failure to promptly delete information that was found to be inaccurate, or could not be verified, or that the source of information had advised Experian to delete;

g) The failure to take adequate steps to verify information Experian had reason to believe was inaccurate before including it in the credit report of the consumer.

29. As a result of the conduct, action and inaction of Experian, the Plaintiff suffered damage by loss of credit, loss of ability to purchase and benefit from credit, a chilling effect on applications for future credit, and the mental and emotional pain, anguish, humiliation and embarrassment of credit denial.

30. The conduct, action and inaction of Experian was willful rendering Experian liable for actual, statutory and punitive damages in an amount to be determined by a Judge and/or Jury pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1681n.

31. The Plaintiff is entitled to recover reasonable costs and attorney's fees from Experian in an amount to be determined by the Court pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1681n.

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff, Elchonon Schwartz, an individual, demands judgment in his favor against Defendant, Experian, for damages together with attorney's fees and court costs pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1681n.

## **SECOND CAUSE OF ACTION**

### **(Negligent Violation of the FCRA as to Experian)**

32. Plaintiff incorporates by reference all of the above paragraphs of this Complaint as though fully stated herein with the same force and effect as if the same were set forth at length herein.

33. This is an action for negligent violation of the Fair Credit Reporting Act U.S.C. § 1681 *et seq.*

34. Experian violated 15 U.S.C. § 1681i(a) by failing to delete inaccurate information from the credit file of the Plaintiff after receiving actual notice of such inaccuracies and conducting

reinvestigation and by failing to maintain reasonable procedures with which to verify the disputed information in the credit file of the Plaintiff.

35. Experian has negligently failed to comply with the Act. The failure of Experian to comply with the Act include but are not necessarily limited to the following:

- a) The failure to follow reasonable procedures to assure the maximum possible accuracy of the information reported;
- b) The failure to correct erroneous personal information regarding the Plaintiff after a reasonable request by the Plaintiff;
- c) The failure to remove and/or correct the inaccuracy and derogatory credit information after a reasonable request by the Plaintiff;
- d) The failure to promptly and adequately investigate information which Defendant Experian had notice was inaccurate;
- e) The continual placement of inaccurate information into the credit report of the Plaintiff after being advised by the Plaintiff that the information was inaccurate;
- f) The failure to promptly delete information that was found to be inaccurate, or could not be verified, or that the source of information had advised Experian to delete;
- g) The failure to take adequate steps to verify information Experian had reason to believe was inaccurate before including it in the credit report of the consumer.

36. As a result of the conduct, action and inaction of Experian, the Plaintiff suffered damage by loss of credit, loss of ability to purchase and benefit from credit, a chilling effect on applications for future credit, and the mental and emotional pain, anguish, humiliation and embarrassment of credit denial.

37. The conduct, action and inaction of Experian was negligent, entitling the Plaintiff to damages under 15 U.S.C. § 1681o.

38. The Plaintiff is entitled to recover reasonable costs and attorney's fees from Experian in an amount to be determined by the Court pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1681n and 1681o.

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff, Elchonon Schwartz, an individual, demands judgment in his favor against Defendant, Experian, for damages together with attorney's fees and court costs pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1681o.

### **THIRD CAUSE OF ACTION**

#### **(Willful Violation of the FCRA as to VW Credit)**

39. Plaintiff incorporates by reference all of the above paragraphs of this Complaint as though fully stated herein with the same force and effect as if the same were set forth at length herein.

40. This is an action for willful violation of the Fair Credit Reporting Act U.S.C. § 1681 *et seq.*

41. Pursuant to the Act, all persons who furnished information to reporting agencies must participate in re-investigations conducted by the agencies when consumers dispute the accuracy and completeness of information contained in a consumer credit report.

42. Pursuant to the Act, a furnisher of disputed information is notified by the reporting agency when the agency receives a notice of dispute from a consumer such as the Plaintiff. The furnisher must then conduct a timely investigation of the disputed information and review all relevant information provided by the agency.

43. The results of the investigation must be reported to the agency and, if the investigation reveals that the original information is incomplete or inaccurate, the information from a furnisher such as Defendant must report the results to other agencies which were supplied such information.



44. Defendant VW Credit violated 15 U.S.C. § 1681s-2(a) by the publishing of the Account Liability Representation; by failing to fully and improperly investigate the dispute of the Plaintiff with respect to the Account Liability Representation; by failing to review all relevant information regarding same by failing to correctly report results of an accurate investigation to the credit reporting agencies.

45. Specifically, Defendant VW Credit continued to report this account on the Plaintiff's credit report after being notified of his dispute regarding the false past due entry.

46. As a result of the conduct, action and inaction of the Defendant VW Credit, the Plaintiff suffered damage for the loss of credit, loss of the ability to purchase and benefit from credit, a chilling effect on applications for future credit, and the mental and emotional pain, anguish, humiliation and embarrassment of credit denials.

47. The conduct, action and inaction of Defendant VW Credit was willful, rendering Defendant VW Credit liable for actual, statutory and punitive damages in an amount to be determined by a jury pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1681n.

48. The Plaintiff is entitled to recover reasonable costs and attorney's fees from Defendant VW Credit in an amount to be determined by the Court pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1681n.

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff, Elchonon Schwartz, an individual, demands judgment in his favor against Defendant, VW Credit, for damages together with attorney's fees and court costs pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1681n.

#### **FOURTH CAUSE OF ACTION**

##### **(Negligent Violation of the FCRA as to VW Credit)**

49. Plaintiff incorporates by reference all of the above paragraphs of this Complaint as though fully stated herein with the same force and effect as if the same were set forth at length herein.

50. This is an action for negligent violation of the Fair Credit Reporting Act U.S.C. § 1681 *et seq.*
51. Pursuant to the Act, all persons who furnished information to reporting agencies must participate in re-investigations conducted by the agencies when consumers dispute the accuracy and completeness of information contained in a consumer credit report.
52. Pursuant to the Act, a furnisher of disputed information is notified by the reporting agency when the agency receives a notice of dispute from a consumer such as the Plaintiff. The furnisher must then conduct a timely investigation of the disputed information and review all relevant information provided by the agency.
53. The results of the investigation must be reported to the agency and, if the investigation reveals that the original information is incomplete or inaccurate, the information from a furnisher such as the Defendant must report the results to other agencies which were supplied such information.
54. Defendant VW Credit is liable to the Plaintiff for failing to comply with the requirements imposed on furnishers of information pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1681s-2b.
55. After receiving the Dispute Notice from Experian, Defendant VW Credit negligently failed to conduct its reinvestigation in good faith.
56. A reasonable investigation would require a furnisher such as Defendant VW Credit to consider and evaluate a specific dispute by the consumer, along with all other facts, evidence and materials provided by the agency to the furnisher.
57. The conduct, action and inaction of Defendant VW Credit was negligent, entitling the Plaintiff to recover actual damages under 15 U.S.C. § 1681o.

58. As a result of the conduct, action and inaction of the Defendant VW Credit, the Plaintiff suffered damage for the loss of credit, loss of the ability to purchase and benefit from credit, a chilling effect on applications for future credit, and the mental and emotional pain, anguish, humiliation and embarrassment of credit denials.

59. The Plaintiff is entitled to recover reasonable costs and attorney's fees from the Defendant VW Credit in an amount to be determined by the Court pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1681n and 1681o.

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff, Elchonon Schwartz, an individual, demands judgment in his favor against Defendant, VW Credit, for damages together with attorney's fees and court costs pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1681o.

#### **DEMAND FOR TRIAL BY JURY**

60. Plaintiff demands and hereby respectfully requests a trial by jury for all claims and issues this complaint to which Plaintiff is or may be entitled to a jury trial.

#### **PRAYER FOR RELIEF**

**WHEREFORE**, Plaintiff demands judgment from each Defendant as follows:

- a) For actual damages provided and pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1681o(a) be awarded for each negligent violation as alleged herein;
- b) For actual damages provided and pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1640(a)(1);
- c) For Statutory damages provided and pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1681n(a);
- d) For Statutory damages provided and pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1640(a)(2);
- e) For Punitive damages provided and pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1681n(a)(2);

- f) For attorney fees and costs provided and pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1681n(a)(3), 15 U.S.C. § 1681o(a)(2) and 15 U.S.C. § 1640(a)(3);
- g) For any such other and further relief, as well as further costs, expenses and disbursements of this action as this Court may deem just and proper.

Dated: October 15, 2020

/s/ Mark Rozenberg  
**Stein Saks, PLLC**  
By: Mark Rozenberg  
285 Passaic Street  
Hackensack, NJ 07601  
Phone: (201) 282-6500  
Fax: (201)-282-6501  
mrozenberg@steinsakslegal.com